

# Johanna Kinkel's Pedagogical Approaches as a Socio-Political Mirror of Her Time

*Anja Bunzel*

## ABSTRACT

Throughout her lifetime, Johanna Kinkel (1810-1858), a German composer, music pedagogue, and writer, was acknowledged for the extraordinary support of her husband, the German revolutionary Gottfried Kinkel (1815-1882), who, with the help of his wife and several political confederates, escaped from political captivity in 1850. Johanna Kinkel's reputation as Gottfried Kinkel's life saver as well as her own exceptional biography eclipsed her artistic output as well as her pedagogical and theoretical writings. Johanna Kinkel's strong sense of justice, her remarkable perseverance, her courage to question socio-political and cultural conventions, as well as her witty Rhineland character are reflected in both her fictional and non-fictional writings. Having taught more than 200 music students during her lifetime, Kinkel was a well-experienced piano and singing teacher. This article will examine Johanna Kinkel's pedagogical ideas considering both technical aspects as well as features regarding the factual content. By means of exemplary content analysis, I will expose allusions to socio-political criticism in Kinkel's pedagogical compositions as well as her non-fictional and fictional writings. The aim of this article is to ascertain how Kinkel's involvement in politics and her unconventional mind set had an impact on her pedagogical approach, which in turn might have influenced her reception as an artist and pedagogue.

*“But the teacher must not disregard the influence  
of marriage on all women’s learning”.<sup>1</sup>*

As a woman of the nineteenth century, Johanna Kinkel (1810-1858) stands out as extraordinary.<sup>2</sup> Her ordeal of getting divorced from a Catholic tyrant, of converting to the Protestant faith and marrying the Protestant theologian Gottfried Kinkel (1815-1882) has been documented by both Kinkel’s contemporaries and recent scholars.<sup>3</sup> Kinkel’s role as the wife of a like-minded revolutionary and a mother of four children has been discussed just as much as her aversion to the household chores and typical female activities such as needlework and cooking.<sup>4</sup> However, her artistic biography is relatively unexplored even though she produced more than

---

<sup>1</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *8 Briefe an eine Freundin über Clavier-Unterricht* (Stuttgart & Tübingen: Cotta, 1852), 16. Original citation: “Aber der Lehrer darf nicht außer Acht lassen, welchen Schritt in alles Lernen der Frauen die Heirath macht.” Unless otherwise noted, all translations are my own.

<sup>2</sup> A shorter version of this essay was first presented at the Annual Conference of the Society for Musicology in Ireland (SMI) in June 2013. I wish to extend my sincere thanks to the SMI for giving me the chance to read this paper, which resulted in numerous inspiring remarks by experienced scholars. Furthermore, I wish to extend my deepest gratitude and appreciation to those involved in the process of academic fine-tuning of this article, especially Dr. Lorraine Byrne Bodley, Dr. Antonio Cascelli, Dr. Laura Watson, and the editorial board of *Musicological Explorations*. Finally, I wish to thank the Irish Research Council for their generous support of my research.

<sup>3</sup> For example, Fanny Lewald, *Zwölf Bilder nach dem Leben* (Berlin: Otto Janke, 1888), 3ff.; Clara G. Ervedosa, “Johanna Kinkel,” in *Vom Salon zur Barrikade: Frauen der Heinezeit*, ed. Irina Hundt (Stuttgart and Weimar: Metzler, 2002), 323-335; Monica Klaus, *Johanna Kinkel: Romantik und Revolution* (Cologne: Böhlau, 2008), 15ff.

<sup>4</sup> Cf. Monica Klaus, *Johanna Kinkel: Romantik und Revolution* (Cologne: Böhlau, 2008), 4ff.

ninety compositions,<sup>5</sup> directed the *Bonner Gesangverein*, and wrote a remarkable number of pedagogical works. Although a significant portion of Kinkel's compositional oeuvre was performed and published during her lifetime, she was not able to make a living from it. Untypically, however, she had to contribute to the finances of the household over a long period of the Kinkels' joint life, as Gottfried Kinkel's marriage to a divorced, converted Catholic woman, as well as his democratic worldview, disadvantaged his professional career to a great extent. Music teaching and piano lessons seemed to be the major source of income for the Kinkels, but the total number of students depended upon Johanna's reputation, which was influenced by her own as well as her husband's political activities. Up until the end of 1848, Johanna Kinkel had participated in the democrats' revolution only passively by supporting her husband's ideologically driven speeches, foundations and trips.<sup>6</sup> However, numerous intrigues and aspersions, which resulted in the loss of all of her piano students, motivated Kinkel to participate more

---

<sup>5</sup> Kinkel published 80 lieder; a choral work, *Hymnus In Coena Domini*; and two singing methods. Most of her stage works remained unpublished: *Vogelkantate* (Op. 1); *Die Landpartie* (unpublished); *Savigny und Themis oder die Olympier in Berlin* (unpublished); *Verrückte Komödien aus Berlin* (manuscript missing); *Das Malzthier* (unpublished); *Otto der Schütz* (unpublished); *Die Assasinen* (unpublished); *Jubiläum des Großvaters* (unpublished); *The Baker and the Mice* (manuscript missing); *Die Fürstin von Paphos* (manuscript missing). Besides these musical works, Kinkel also published numerous novellas and a two-volume novel, *Hans Ibeles in London*.

<sup>6</sup> Gottfried Kinkel gave his first public speech favouring a democracy on 20 March 1848, at Bonn City Hall. On 27 March, he established a *Central-Bürgerversammlung* [Central Assembly of the Citizens], followed by his petition for craftsmen on 19 April; the establishment of the *Handwerkerbildungsverein* [Craftsmen's Educational Association] and the establishment of the *Demokratischen Verein* [Democrats' Association]. On 6 August, Gottfried Kinkel took on the editorship of the *Bonner Zeitung*, Bonn's only democratic newspaper and on 15 November, he appealed for tax refusal in the public.

actively in the current politics. On 6 December 1848, she published her “Demokratenlied” [“Democrats’ Song”] (advocating the fight for a ‘red monarchy,’ i.e. a republic) in the democrats’ daily newspaper *Bonner Zeitung* that was edited by Gottfried Kinkel; shortly after, on 16 December 1848, the song was published as an individual work by the music publisher Sulzbach, which enabled a rapid distribution of the piece and long-term public access to the composition.<sup>7</sup>

Through consideration of Kinkel’s pedagogical compositions as well as her fictional and non-fictional writings, this article will ascertain Kinkel’s engagement with the political, cultural, and musical thought of her time, which she both challenged and conformed to. In this paper I will examine Kinkel’s pedagogical works, analyse her theoretical writings about teaching and her music-historical lectures. Finally, I will discuss how and why Kinkel’s works attracted a certain socio-political taste group, which in turn influenced her reception as an artist and pedagogue.

### **Johanna Kinkel’s *Anleitung zum Singen / Songs for Little Children* (Opus 20)**

Kinkel devoted two opuses to specifically pedagogical purposes, namely the instructive exercises *Anleitung zum Singen / Songs for Little Children* (Opus 20) and *Tonleitern und Solfeggien / Solfeggios for the Contralto Voice* (Opus 22). Opus 20, published in 1849, was composed during 1848 and includes twenty-six short pieces for children between the ages of three and seven. The work could be considered a cycle, leading young singers through an entire calendar year and covering major festivities such as Easter,<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup> Johanna Kinkel, “Demokratenlied” (Bonn: Sulzbach, 1848).

<sup>8</sup> “Vom Osterhääschen” [“About the Easter Bunny”], No. 7.

Christmas,<sup>9</sup> seasonal specialties,<sup>10</sup> as well as important dates in the Kinkels' calendar, such as family birthdays.<sup>11</sup> In her preface to this opus, Kinkel recommends adjusting names and places mentioned in the songs according to the personal circumstances of the student.<sup>12</sup> Furthermore, the opus is a musical record of Gottfried Kinkel's political activities during the summer of 1848, as reflected by the Lied "Von der Bürgerwache" ("About the vigilance committee," No. 10). This song tells the story of a man going out to war from his son's point of view. The son, who still likes to sit on the mother's knee, promises to himself that, "once [he] is grown-up, [he] will fly the flag in black, gold and red and die for the sake of freedom."<sup>13</sup> According to Monica Klaus, this piece was not only sung by Kinkel's own children, but it also made its way quickly into the public life of Bonn.<sup>14</sup>

Kinkel seemed to pursue two objectives within her Opus 20: first, she wanted to help her own children, as well as children of the revolutionary middle class, to psychologically process their father's absence from everyday life for the sake of politics; second, and perhaps more importantly, Kinkel wanted to impart basic knowledge

<sup>9</sup> "Vom Christkindchen" ["About Santa Claus"], No. 25.

<sup>10</sup> "Vom Hääschen höp höp höp" ["About the Rabbit Hop Hop Hop"], No. 22, dealing with the hunting season; "Vom Haselnüsschen" ["About the Hazelnut"], No. 19, telling from the harvest of nuts and grapes.

<sup>11</sup> "Geburtstagsliedchen für die Großmama" ["Birthday Song for Grandma"], No. 15; and "Geburtstagsliedchen für den Vater" ["Birthday Song for the Father"], No. 16.

<sup>12</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Anleitung zum Singen* (Mainz: Schott, 1849), 1.

<sup>13</sup> Original citation: "Jetzt sitz' ich gern noch auf dem Schoß, doch das wird anders bin ich einmal groß, dann schwing' ich hoch die Fahne schwarzgoldroth und für die Freiheit geh ich in den Tod."

<sup>14</sup> Monica Klaus, *Johanna Kinkel*, 163-164.

of the seasons, nature and good manners,<sup>15</sup> as well as teach virtues, encouraging the children's willingness to listen to and respect their seniors such as parents,<sup>16</sup> grandparents,<sup>17</sup> and even the doctor.<sup>18</sup> Such didactic principles seemed to be of more importance to Kinkel than the professional training of the voice, which could also be attributed to the very young age at which the children were supposed to use this singing method. When the work was published in 1849, shortly after Gottfried Kinkel's imprisonment due to subversive behavior, the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* highly recommended the purchase and practice of Kinkel's method. The review not only stressed that "the widow of the unfortunate poet ... will now have to feed her family on her own,"<sup>19</sup> but also highlighted the suitable vocal range of no more than a sixth in any one song and the tasteful piano accompaniments of the songs.<sup>20</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> The best example of Kinkel's aim to advise the children to behave themselves is the last song of the collection, "Vom Brummstälchen" ["About the Mumbler's Barn"], No. 26, in which all naughty children are kept in a barn separate from their mothers until they stop mumbling.

<sup>16</sup> "Vom guten Vater und der lieben Mutter" ["About the Good Father and the Beloved Mother"], No. 1.

<sup>17</sup> "Vom Großvater" ["About the Grandfather"], No. 2; "Von der Großmutter" ["About the Grandmother"], No. 3.

<sup>18</sup> "Vom Doktor Velten" ["About Doctor Velten"], No. 5.

<sup>19</sup> "Gesangschulen," *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 27 (30 September 1849): 141. Original citation: "Die Witwe des unglücklichen Dichters, denn so darf man sie nennen, wird nun die alleinige Ernährung ihrer Familie bleiben, welches schon allein ein hinreichender Grund wäre, dieses Werk zu empfehlen."

<sup>20</sup> Interestingly, the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* mentions the words dealing with the good father and the beloved mother, with Santa Claus, the hazelnuts, granddad, the fat pug dog and the good poodle, but it never refers to the Lied about the vigilance committee or the song "Vom Spektakel" ["About the Racker"], No. 11, which encourages children to be loud and confident.

## **Johanna Kinkel's *Tonleitern und Solfeggien für die Altstimme / Solfeggios for the Contralto Voice* (Opus 22)**

In contrast to Kinkel's Opus 20, her Opus 22 does not contain any pedagogic material of moral value, but instead concentrates purely on vocal training through scales and solfeggios. In the preface to Opus 22, Kinkel criticizes overly ambitious methods, which might overstrain the singers' voices and patience, and advises the student to progress in small steps.

There are many talented musical students, who, being very fond of Singing [*sic*], though not gifted with a strong voice, would be happy to commence vocal practice, if most Solfeggios [*sic*] published till now, did not require too great an extension of voice.<sup>21</sup>

This statement reflects Kinkel's business concept as, when she published this singing method in 1852, she was a resident of London, trying to make a living from teaching. According to her own notes, London was crowded with excellent unemployed teachers and untalented students who wanted to become brilliant singers.<sup>22</sup> To that effect, it was smart to preface an exercise book with such encouraging words.

Interestingly, Johanna Kinkel was not the first teacher to criticize overly ambitious attempts in training young students' voices. Abbé Mainzer, in 1831, raises a similar point in his *Singschule oder praktische Anweisung zum Gesange*. Unlike Johanna Kinkel,

---

<sup>21</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Opus 22: Tonleitern und Solfeggien für die Altstimme / Solfeggios for Contralto-Voice* (London: Schott, 1852), 1. Kinkel's work includes a German and an English preface juxtaposed in columns on page one; the quotation above has been taken from the English original.

<sup>22</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Musikalisches aus London*, no date, Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek (ULB) S 2391, 6 & 17.

who composed less challenging singing exercises for young voices, Mainzer recommends that children at a young age should attend only school lessons and not private lessons, as children “participate in the lessons without the slightest effort and they do not—as in private lessons—try to sing along in excess of their own strengths.”<sup>23</sup> However, Mainzer’s advice against private lessons disregards gender equality, which is discussed by Johann Adam Hiller.<sup>24</sup> As early as 1774, in the preface to his *Anweisung zum musikalisch-richtigen Gesange*, Hiller argues:

Singing lessons at school are deficient, as they do not include girls. Their first aim is to cultivate singers for the church. And following a ridiculous prejudice, one excludes women from something to which they could contribute with greatest elegance, and to which they are entitled just as much as those shouting falsetto alto and soprano voices of bearded or unbearded boys. Even if women cannot be raised to be church singers, would they not be able to use this ability to sing outside of the church? Would we not have been able to raise the odd great female singer, who would have tried her luck abroad and who would have brought

---

<sup>23</sup> Abbé Mainzer, *Singschule oder praktische Anweisung zum Gesange verbunden mit einer allgemeinen Musiklehre* (Trier: Mainzer, 1831), p. ix. Original citation: “Nur der Gesangsunterricht in Schulen ist daher auch für Kinder des zarteren Alters angemessen, weil dieselben hier nur spielend am Unterricht teilnehmen, indem sie nicht, wie beim Privatunterrichte, mitzusingen, mithin oft über ihre Kräfte sich anzustrengen gehalten sind“.

<sup>24</sup> Johann Adam Hiller (1728-1804) was a German composer, who also contributed a great number of writings to music pedagogics and aesthetics. With his outstanding organizational ability and his generous personality, he enriched the musical life in Leipzig, where he resided from 1751 until the end of his life. Cf. Anna Amalie Abert & Thomas Baumann, “Hiller, Johann Adam,” in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Vol. 11, (London: Macmillan, 2001), 512.



honor to her home country? And if this is true, why do we neglect the girls' musical education?<sup>25</sup>

Although the educational system experienced a massive change with the education reform introduced by Wilhelm von Humboldt in 1810,<sup>26</sup> Johanna Kinkel's own struggle as a young girl in developing her musical skills beyond the standards of a bourgeois daughter shows that gender equality was by no means taken for granted.<sup>27</sup> This might have encouraged Kinkel to compose singing methods for small girls and boys that were easy to apply to

---

<sup>25</sup> Johann Adam Hiller, *Anweisung zum musikalisch-richtigen Gesange, mit hinlänglichen Exempeln erläutert* (Leipzig: Johann Friedrich Junius, 1774), no pagination. Original citation: "Beym Studiren des Gesanges auf Schulen findet sich auch noch das Mangelhafte, daß das weibliche Geschlecht gar keinen Antheil daran hat. Der nächste Endzweck ist daselbst, Sänger für die Kirche zu ziehen; und einem albernen Vorurtheile zu Folge schließt man Frauenzimmer von einer Sache aus, deren vornehmste Zierde sie seyn könnten, und zu der sie gewiß ebenso viel Recht haben, als jene überschriene und fistulirende Sopran- oder Altstimmer bärtiger oder unbärtiger Knaben. Aber wenn nun auch Frauenzimmer zur Kirchenmusik nicht gezogen werden könnten, sollte ihnen denn die Geschicklichkeit in der Musik, und besonders im Singen, nicht auch außer der Kirche nützen? Hätte nicht manche gute Sängerinn schon können gezogen werden, die ihr Glück in der Welt gefunden, und ihrem Vaterlande Ehre gemacht hätte? Und wenn das ist, warum vernachlässigt man denn den musikalischen Unterricht so gänzlich bey dem weiblichen Geschlechte?"

<sup>26</sup> Wilhelm von Humboldt (1767-1835), German jurist, appointed Direktor der Sektion für Kultus und Unterricht im Preußischen Ministerium des Innern ["Prussian Minister for culture and education"] in 1809. In the context of the Prussian Reforms in 1809-1810, Humboldt enforced an educational reform, which aimed for a more humanistic education for boys and girls of all social backgrounds. Humboldt introduced the nationalisation of the schools as well as the compulsory education. Cf. Helmut Müller et al., *Deutsche Geschichte in Schlaglichtern*, 2nd edition (Mannheim, Vienna, Zurich: Meyers Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1990), 137.

<sup>27</sup> For Kinkel's constant struggle with her rather conventional mother see Monica Klaus, *Johanna Kinkel*, pp. 3ff.

(even for less experienced teachers) and were taught in a playful manner.

The structure of Kinkel's Opus 22 is quite clear. Each exercise consists of two parts: a scale and a solfeggio. It can be characterized as a very broad training of musicality, not only focusing on correct intonation, but also introducing the student to melodic ornamentations, different meters and rhythms, dynamics, accents, tempi and pacing. The exercises also enable the teacher to introduce the young singer to different styles of piano accompaniment, simple contrapuntal constructions, and to draw attention to several harmonic characteristics.

### **Johanna Kinkel's notes and letters on teaching**

The combination of theory and practice appears to be extraordinarily important to Kinkel. In her *Acht Briefe an eine Freundin über Clavier-Unterricht / Eight Letters to a Friend on Piano Teaching* published in both English and German in 1852, she advises the teachers to "analyze an excellent composition in front of the students from time to time in order to raise their awareness of the inner structure of the composition."<sup>28</sup> Kinkel dedicates a whole chapter to the necessity of teaching music history and theory, as, in her opinion, it is "more important to raise a musical person than to increase the number of piano virtuosos, because these are, after the bravura singers, the least musical people in the world."<sup>29</sup> Kinkel's rather negative

---

<sup>28</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe an eine Freundin über Klavierunterricht / Eight Letters to a Friend* (Stuttgart: Cotta, 1852), 9. Original citation: "Du mußt von Zeit zu Zeit eine ganz vorzügliche Composition vor solchen Schülern analysiren und sie nöthigen, ihre Aufmerksamkeit auf deren innern Bau zu richten."

<sup>29</sup> *Ibid.*, 12. Original citation: "Indeß bedenke, daß es wichtiger ist, den Schüler zu einem wirklich musikalischen Menschen zu bilden, als die Zahl der Claviervirtuoson zu vermehren, denn diese sind nächst den Bravoursängern die unmusikalischsten Personen auf der Welt."

attitude to virtuosity reflects the thinking of her time, as, according to Leon Plantinga, the financial abuse of the close relationship between music, virtuosi, reputation and profit was also uncovered by such contemporaries as Robert Schumann and Heinrich Heine.<sup>30</sup> It is not surprising, therefore, that Kinkel expresses her disfavor of Carl Czerny's teaching methods.<sup>31</sup> James Deaville points out that Czerny "believed that virtuosity could be attained through industry and practice, when methodically pursued,"<sup>32</sup> but Johanna Kinkel prioritizes musical understanding and theoretical knowledge over technical skills. In her novel *Hans Ibeles in London*, published posthumously by Gottfried Kinkel in 1860, Czerny is criticized for his automatism, as "his so-called 'Dexterity of the Fingers' drives all musical sense out of a player's soul, and it only leaves swift fingers."<sup>33</sup> This conforms to James Deaville's observation that, in the 1840s, the

---

<sup>30</sup> Cf. Leon Plantinga, "The Piano and the Nineteenth Century," in *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. Larry Todd, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (New York and London: Routledge), 9.

<sup>31</sup> Carl Czerny (1791-1857) was an Austrian composer, pianist, theorist, historian and music pedagogue. Nowadays, he is widely known for his pedagogical studies and exercises, while his compositions are largely forgotten. His pedagogical works include both instructions focussing on contemporary performance practice and sound pedagogy. As a former student of Beethoven's, Czerny is also well-known for his attempt in preserving Beethoven's legacy with regard to both Beethoven's own works and his compositional and pedagogical principles. Cf. Stephan Lindeman & George Barth, "Czerny, Carl," in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Vol. 6, (London: Macmillan, 2001), 824-827.

<sup>32</sup> James Deaville, "A Star is Born? Czerny, Liszt, and the Pedagogy of Virtuosity," in *Beyond the Art of Finger Dexterity: Reassessing Carl Czerny*, ed. David Gramit (New York: University of Rochester Press, 2008), 58.

<sup>33</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Hans Ibeles in London*, Vol. 1 (Stuttgart: Cotta, 1860), 364. Original citation: "Seine sogenannte 'Schule der Geläufigkeit' treibt alles an musikalischem Gefühl aus der Seele einer Spielerin, und lässt nur geschwinde Finger übrig."

expectations of a virtuoso were subject to “fundamental transformation of the virtuoso from a technician to an interpreter ... from a set of fingers to a personality.”<sup>34</sup> Like Hans Ibeles, the main protagonist in the correspondent novel, Johanna Kinkel recommends the study of basso continuo exercises as anti-venom to technical over-eagerness.<sup>35</sup>

When Kinkel points out the importance of discussing harmonic relationships within music with the student, we are presented with a typical nineteenth-century naturalist perspective on gender. Kinkel stresses, “everything mathematical naturally constitutes a special difficulty for women”<sup>36</sup> and thus demands extraordinary patience. Another interesting point raised by Kinkel is that “the teacher must not disregard the influence of marriage on all women’s learning.”<sup>37</sup> Therefore, according to Kinkel, it is necessary “to arrange certain educational steps that enable dilettantes to consolidate their basic musical knowledge so that they will never ever forget what they have learned in the course of their life.”<sup>38</sup>

Kinkel’s awareness of the nineteenth-century gender roles is also reflected in her explanation of the basic harmonic components of a sonata in that she uses the household as an allegory in order to humorously illustrate the role of the tonic (i.e. the husband), dominant (i.e. housewife), subdominant (i.e. the son), the mediants (i.e. the

---

<sup>34</sup> James Deaville, “A Star is Born,” 54.

<sup>35</sup> Cf. Johanna Kinkel, *Hans Ibeles in London*, Vol. 1, 364; and Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 13.

<sup>36</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 13. Original citation: “Alles Mathematische ist für die weibliche Natur mit einer besonderen Schwierigkeit verknüpft.”

<sup>37</sup> Ibid., 15. For original citation see the page title of this essay.

<sup>38</sup> Ibid. Original citation: “Diese Rücksicht schon alleine macht es nöthig, für Dilettantinnen bestimmte Stufen anzuordnen, auf denen es möglich ist, sich so festzustellen, daß sie im Laufe des Lebens das Erlernte nicht mehr verlieren zu können.”

daughters) and the seventh chords (i.e. the neighbors).<sup>39</sup> In contrast to Carl Czerny, who, according to Deanna C. Davis, reminds female readers in his *Letters on the Art of Playing the Pianoforte* of their womanly role in society, and who asks the young ladies not to neglect their duties in the household for the sake of music,<sup>40</sup> Kinkel seems to criticize the gendered division of male and female activities, and mocks gender conventions. In accordance with this, the young maiden Meta Braun in Kinkel's novel *Hans Ibeles* philosophizes that "there are no female or male activities, but mechanical and intellectual activities."<sup>41</sup> Kinkel expressed her disapproval of the nineteenth-century gender conventions on many occasions, especially after the successful divorce of her own first marriage. For example, in her *Erinnerungsblätter aus dem Jahre 1849* [*Memoires from 1849*], she states:

My first marriage is the story of thousands of my sisters, and the logical consequence of our social situation. Numerous women collapse under similar circumstances, while hardly anyone out of a whole generation has the courage to break free and rescue her better self.<sup>42</sup>

---

<sup>39</sup> Ibid.

<sup>40</sup> Deanna C. Davis, "The Veil of Fiction: Pedagogy and Rhetorical Strategies in Carl Czerny's *Letters on the Art of Playing the Pianoforte*," in *Beyond the Art of Finger Dexterity: Reassessing Carl Czerny*, ed. David Gramit (New York: University of Rochester Press, 2008), 67-81, 75.

<sup>41</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Hans Ibeles*, 269. Original citation: "Es gibt meiner Ueberzeugung nach keine männlichen und weiblichen Arbeiten, sondern es gibt mechanische Arbeiten und Arbeiten der Intelligenz".

<sup>42</sup> Johanna Kinkel, "Erinnerungsblätter aus dem Jahre 1848," in *Deutsche Monatsschrift für Politik, Wissenschaft, Kunst und Leben* 4 (1851): 98. Original citation: "Meine erste Heirath ist die Geschichte von Tausenden meiner Schwestern, und das nothwendige Resultat unserer sozialen Zustände. Unzählige Frauen gehen an ähnlichen Verhältnissen zu Grunde, indeß von einer ganzen Generation kaum eine den Muth hat, sich loszureissen und ihr besseres Selbst zu retten."

The socio-cultural relevance of Kinkel's writings is also revealed when the author warns the teacher not to "sacrifice a portion of the child's life for the sake of the mother's addiction to fashion, if the child has neither natural talent nor a great [musical] affinity."<sup>43</sup> Here, Kinkel refers to the fashion of music in the supposedly educated social forum, the salon, against which she rails, "one can hardly visit a society without having to endure music, and what a dire kind of music!"<sup>44</sup>

At a technical level, Kinkel stresses the importance of patience, in regards to physical training of both the fingers and the voice, as well as the development of emotional and intellectual maturity. This is why Kinkel allows a fair amount of time for the acquisition of mechanical piano skills, namely, the correct finger positions and the understanding of the correct, musically grammatical accentuation.<sup>45</sup> Once the emotional maturity has been acquired through a few years of practice, the pianist will, according to Kinkel, be able

---

<sup>43</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 11. Original citation: "[U]nd ich möchte jede Mutter warnen, aus bloßer Modesucht einen Theil der Lebenszeit ihres Kindes dem Erlernen derselben aufzuopfern, wenn es nicht natürliches Talent oder große Vorliebe dafür äußert."

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., 19. Original citation: "Kaum, daß man eine Gesellschaft besuchen kann, ohne Musik ausstehen zu müssen, und was für entsetzliche Musik!"

<sup>45</sup> Ibid., 5. With regards to accentuation and classification of musical accents, Kinkel refers to Kirnberger's *Akzenttheorie* and divides accents into three categories, namely, the grammatical, oratorical, and expressive accents. For details on *Akzenttheorie* cf. William E. Caplin, "Theories of musical rhythm in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries," in *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*, ed. Thomas Christensen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 670. Kinkel deliberately uses late eighteenth-century theories of rhythmic structure, and criticizes the expanded *Akzenttheorie* incorporating the Hegelian concept of thesis, antithesis and synthesis, introduced by Kinkel's contemporary Moritz Hauptmann (1792-1862), as a "ridiculous confusion of terminology." Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 7. Original citation: "lächerliche Wort- und Begriffsconfusion."

to play contemporary music, the majority of which “requires a subtle and soulful interpretation; the mechanical challenges have been pushed backward.”<sup>46</sup> Kinkel concludes her *Eight Letters* with a short excursion to music history, praising Mendelssohn and Chopin, as well as Adolf Henselt<sup>47</sup> and Sigismond Thalberg,<sup>48</sup> for their reformation of piano music towards a more emotional way of composing. This awareness, according to Linda Siegel, possibly turns the *Eight Letters* into “the first piece of musical literature to understand the importance of Mendelssohn’s *Songs Without Words* to the history of piano music.”<sup>49</sup> Yet, Chopin seems to impress Kinkel even more

---

<sup>46</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 16. Original citation: “Die Mehrzahl der neuesten Claviercompositionen erfordert vor Allem einen feinen und seelenvollen Vortrag; die mechanischen Schwierigkeiten sind so ziemlich in den Hintergrund gedrängt worden.”

<sup>47</sup> Adolf Henselt (1814-1889) was a German composer and pianist. He is especially well known for his studies in piano technique published between 1837-1838 as Opera 2 and 5, and which, according to Richard Beattie Davis, are clearly influenced by Henselt’s fondness for both Chopin and Weber. Cf. Richard Beattie Davis, “Henselt, Adolf,” in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Vol. 11, (London: Macmillan, 2001), 383.

<sup>48</sup> Sigismond Thalberg (1812-1871) was a Swiss pianist and composer. He became famous as a salon pianist at the early age of 14, and he published his first works at 16. Thalberg was first seen as a competitor of Franz Liszt’s (1811-1886). However, as Robert Wangermée states, the rivalry between the two virtuosi stopped when both pianists gave a joint concert and agreed to “cooperate with other famous virtuosos in composing ... a tribute to the princess.” Thalberg mainly played his own fantasia compositions, which usually derived from famous opera arias written by composers such as Rossini, Verdi, Donizetti, Meyerbeer, Weber, and Mozart. Cf. Robert Wangermée, “Thalberg, Sigismond,” in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Vol. 25, (London: Macmillan, 2001), 383.

<sup>49</sup> Siegel, Linda, “Johanna Kinkel’s ‘Chopin als Komponist’ and Other Musical Writings: Untapped Source Readings in the History of Romantic Music Author(s),” *College Music Symposium* 43 (2003): 110.

than Mendelssohn, especially his attempt to question the division of the tonal corpus by semitones.<sup>50</sup> She wisely remarks:

We, who got used to the established division in semitones, sense this innovation as eerie and as mere noise; but the next or third generation might appreciate in it a fresh and twice as rich an art, once the strange sounds have been absorbed.<sup>51</sup>

### Johanna Kinkel's *Lectures and Notes on Musical History*

In the 1850s Kinkel wrote several lectures on such composers as Mendelssohn, Beethoven, Mozart and Chopin. According to Marianne Bröcker, she also wrote the “most substantial and meaningful” monograph about Chopin.<sup>52</sup> The monograph contains 195 pages and deals with several of Chopin’s pieces.<sup>53</sup> Unlike Franz Liszt, who wrote the first large-scale biography of Chopin during 1850–1851, Kinkel focused on Chopin’s compositions rather than the pure facts of Chopin’s life. In his biography, Liszt writes:

---

<sup>50</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 18.

<sup>51</sup> Ibid. Original citation: “Aber uns, die wir an die längst bestandene Einteilung in halbe Töne gewöhnt sind, wird die Neuerung schauerlich und wie ein bloßes Geräusch klingen: doch vielleicht schon begrüßt die nächst- oder drittfolgende Generation, wenn sie erst mit der Muttermilch die fremden Klänge eingesogen hat, in ihnen eine frischerstandene, doppelt so reiche Kunst.”

<sup>52</sup> Marianne Bröcker, “Johanna Kinkels schriftstellerische und musikpädagogische Tätigkeit,” in *Studien zur Bonner Musikgeschichte des 18. und 19. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Marianne Bröcker & Günther Massenkeil (Cologne: Arno Volk-Verlag, 1978), 42.

<sup>53</sup> By comparison, Kinkel’s *Lecture on Beethoven* contains forty pages, the *Lecture on Mendelssohn* contains thirty-seven pages, and the *Lecture on Mozart* contains thirty-two pages.



If it were our intention to discuss the development of Piano [*sic*] music in the language of the Schools [*sic*], we would dissect [Chopin's] magnificent pages, which afford so rich a field for scientific observation. We would, in the first place, analyze his *Nocturnes*, *Ballades*, *Impromptus*, *Scherzos*, which are full of refinements of harmony never heard before; bold and of startling originality. We would also examine his *Polonaises*, *Mazourkas* [*sic*], *Waltzes and Boleros*.<sup>54</sup>

It seems that Johanna Kinkel, being an excellent pianist and a knowledgeable analyst, aimed for such a study, as she not only referred to Chopin's works in isolation, but also placed them within their historical context.

Kinkel's section on etudes reflects her personal musical development. Whereas Kinkel recommends Herz's exercises in her earlier works on piano teaching, she refers to the vacuity of this composer's exercises in her lecture on Chopin:

An etude, which we learn for the sake of its difficulty, should train the intellect to the same extent as the fingers. It is insufferable to have to repeat unsubstantial scales and leaps more than 100 times, because the finger did not clearly hit the note. Czerny and Herz's schools have done the most monstrous within this area, and I believe that they will make those musicians stupid who devote their ears to the exercises of these and similar composers.<sup>55</sup>

---

<sup>54</sup> Franz Liszt, *Life of Chopin*, transl. Martha Walker Cook (Boston and New York: Ditson, 1863), 22.

<sup>55</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Friedrich Chopin als Komponist*, 1855, ULB S 2399, 119. Original citation: "Eine Etüde, die wir um der Schwierigkeit willen erlernen, sollte vor allem den Verstand in gleichem Verhältnis wie die Finger beschäftigen. Es ist unerträglich, ganz inhaltlose Läufe und Sprünge mehr als hundertmal wiederholen zu müssen, weil der Finger ein paar Noten nicht rein trifft. Das Monströseste auf diesem Felde hat die Schule von Czerny und Herz getan, und ich glaube, daß Musiker, welche ihre Ohren zum Studium dieser und ähnlicher Komponisten hergeben, daran verdummen müssen."

Here, Kinkel seems to allude to Czerny's foreword to his *Vierzig tägliche Studien* [*Forty Daily Studies*] (Opus 337), in which, according to James Deaville, Czerny explains that his "exercises, repeated measure by measure, up to thirty times each measure, were for the purpose of training and maintaining virtuosity."<sup>56</sup> With regard to Chopin's etudes, Kinkel compliments the ingenious melodic and harmonic constitution, as "even if our fingers have technically mastered the most difficult etude, our intellectual interest in the compositional structure will not run out for a long time yet."<sup>57</sup> Marianne Bröcker highlights Kinkel's practical approach to music in her lecture on Chopin, showing Kinkel's experience as both a pianist and a pedagogue.<sup>58</sup>

Kinkel's lectures on Mendelssohn and Mozart do not include as many practical insights, but examine the music from a contemporary perspective and are aimed towards the history of compositional thought and development.<sup>59</sup> This reflects Kinkel's strong tendency to critically examine compositional features and categorizations, an approach that demands a complex understanding of compositional developments and specialties of several musical epochs.<sup>60</sup> Kinkel's critical thinking becomes

---

<sup>56</sup> James Deaville, "A Star is Born," 59.

<sup>57</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Friedrich Chopin als Komponist*, 126. Original citation: "Selbst wenn unsre Finger die mühsamste Etüde technisch bezwungen haben, so ist das Interesse des Verstandes an ihrem Tonbau noch lange nicht erschöpft."

<sup>58</sup> Marianne Bröcker, "Johanna Kinkels schriftstellerische und musikpädagogische Tätigkeit," 43.

<sup>59</sup> Another reason for the lack of practical impact in Kinkel's other lectures could be her own specialization in piano teaching and her conception that Mozart's "piano-forte works ... however fine they may be, are less important." Johanna Kinkel, *Lecture on Mozart*, no date, ULB S 2396, no pagination; original citation in English.

<sup>60</sup> The English-language sketch of the *Musical History* includes a comprehensive examination of music history, including Egyptian and Greek music as well as important ancient theories put forward by Pythagoras, Guido, Plinius, Boethius, Gregor the Great, Carolus Magnus, Joannes de Fulda, Hucbaldus, and Franco from Cologne. Johanna Kinkel, *Musical History*, 1853 (?), ULB S 2393, no pagination.

obvious in both her *Lecture on Musical History* and her *Lecture on Harmony*, which, based on a letter to Auguste Heinrich on 4 December 1857, must have been presented in the British Museum between 1857 and 1858.<sup>61</sup> In both lectures, Kinkel critically exposes the role of Palestrina within the historical discourse of composition, thus supplying another example of her courage to question the fashions of her time. The nineteenth-century 'Renaissance' of Palestrina's music,<sup>62</sup> as well as the appearance of the first monographs on him written by Baini and von Winterfeld's (and published in 1828<sup>63</sup> and 1832<sup>64</sup> respectively), resulted from an increased interest in the sixteenth-century rescuer of church music and the subsequent revival of his life and works. Yet Kinkel downgrades Palestrina:

[He] wisely used his excellent position at the pontifical chapel to burst the bounds of the true church style; but some of his little-known contemporaries produced works that are of equal, if not superior beauty to his own compositions.<sup>65</sup>

<sup>61</sup> Adelheid von Asten-Kinkel, "Johanna Kinkel in England," *Deutsche Revue* 21 (1901): 188.

<sup>62</sup> According to Peter Ackermann, nineteenth-century reformatory movements of both Protestant and Catholic confession, who aimed for a 'Renaissance' of Palestrina's music in order to promote the ideal of a true and pure church style, concentrated on Palestrina and his distinct style as the major ambassador of classical vocal polyphony. Peter Ackermann, "Palestrina," in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, ed. Ludwig Finscher, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Vol. 13, Personenteil (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2005), 41.

<sup>63</sup> Giuseppe Baini, *Memorie storico-critiche della vita e delle opere di G. P. da Palestrina*, 2 volumes (Rome: Societa Tipografica, 1828).

<sup>64</sup> Carl von Winterfeld, *Johannes Pierluigi von Palestrina: Seine Werke und deren Bedeutung für die Geschichte der Tonkunst: Mit Bezug auf Baini's neueste Forschungen* (Breslau: Adelholz, 1832).

<sup>65</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Zur Geschichte der Musik*, 3. Original citation: "Er hat gewiß die hervorragende Stellung die er an der päpstlichen [sic.] Capelle besaß, mit weiser Einsicht benützt, um dem wahren Kirchenstyl die Bahn zu brechen; aber manche seiner minder bekannten Zeitgenossen haben Werke geschaffen die den seinen in Schönheit gleich, wenn nicht überlegen sind."

Another example of Kinkel's ability to challenge conventions is the way in which she organizes the history of music. Raphael Georg Kiesewetter (1773-1850) published his *Geschichte der europäisch-abendländischen, oder unsrer heutigen Musik* in 1832 (second edition 1846; English translation 1848). It is considered to be the "first general music history,"<sup>66</sup> and it focuses on musical genres and styles.<sup>67</sup> Kinkel's chronology is similar to Kiesewetter's, but Kinkel adds another aspect for determining musical history: the evolution of dissonance. Kinkel's approach is based on arguments more wide-ranging, as reflected in the chapter on Monteverdi, for example. Whereas Kiesewetter bases his argument for Monteverdi's influence on the dramatic opera, Kinkel explains the inclusion of Monteverdi as a historical landmark based on both his contribution to the development of a dramatic opera, as well as his perception that "the freie [*sic*] entry of dissonances is compatible with melodic beauty."<sup>68</sup>

Kinkel's observations, although ahead of her time, have remained un-researched and unacknowledged until recently, as most of her theoretical writings had never been published. For example, in 1971, Jerome Roche opens his monograph on Palestrina by stating, "until recently, Palestrina was seen to stand alone in musical history as the great culmination of the age of polyphony. Even the appearance of the Lassus and Victoria editions early in this [twentieth] century failed to substitute a comparative historical

---

<sup>66</sup> Herfried Kier, "Kiesewetter," in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, ed. Ludwig Finscher, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Vol. 10, Personenteil (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2003), 90.

<sup>67</sup> Cf. Thomas Hochradner, "Probleme der Periodisierung von Musikgeschichte," in *Acta Musicologica* 67 (1995), 60.

<sup>68</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Zur Geschichte der Musik*, 1853 (?), ULB S 2393, 4. Original citation: "Der nächste Reformator der den Muth hatte einen Schritt weiter als alle Vorgänger zu gehen, war Monteverdi, der das freie Eintreten von Dissonanzen mit der melodischen Schönheit für vereinbar hielt."

approach for the isolated detachment of the Palestrina revival.”<sup>69</sup> Ironically, Kinkel mentions Lassus as one of Palestrina's contemporaries, whose compositions might have exceeded the beauty of Palestrina's works.<sup>70</sup>

Despite Kinkel's progressive approaches to music history, her writings also reflect analytical, aesthetic and socio-political aspects typical of nineteenth-century scholarship. In her analyses of Beethoven sonatas, Kinkel, like her contemporary Wilhelm von Lenz (1809-1883),<sup>71</sup> not only uses romanticized metaphors as a means of musical characterization, but also employs the notion of a general musical idea (*Idee*), which is, according to Scott Burnham, also evident in A. B. Marx's critical oeuvre.<sup>72</sup> In the introduction to her analysis of Opus 10, No. 2, Kinkel explains, “its motives are like the discourse of living beings, to whom we might ascribe the manners of older or younger people, with either serious or playful predictions,”<sup>73</sup> which corresponds to Marx's theory of a characteristic art and his notion that “Beethoven's music represented ... concrete

---

<sup>69</sup> Jerome Roche, *Palestrina* (London: Oxford University Press, 1971), 7.

<sup>70</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Zur Geschichte der Musik*, 3.

<sup>71</sup> A comparison of Wilhelm von Lenz' and Kinkel's analysis of Beethoven's piano sonata Opus 10, No. 2 confirms von Lenz' conclusion that “music has achieved its purpose so long as it has kindled a poetic idea in its performer, in its listener. The same music can quite easily arouse thoughts of sadness in one, thoughts of gaiety in another; it is a matter of secondary circumstances, external to art, and this very vagueness is one of the qualities by which music aspires to the infinite which is its soul.” Cf. Ian Bent, *Music Analysis in the Nineteenth Century* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999), 73. Unlike Lenz's, Kinkel's interpretation includes connotations to the family life and household in Beethoven's sonata rather than allusions to nature or myths.

<sup>72</sup> Scott Burnham, “The Role of Sonata Form in A. B. Marx's Theory of Form,” *Journal of Music Theory* 33 (1989): 260.

<sup>73</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Lecture on Beethoven's earliest sonatas including Opus 10*, ULB 2397, no pagination. Original citation in English.

external events.”<sup>74</sup> Also Marx’s approach to musical organicism is reflected in both Kinkel’s notion of the organic nature of harmony and her Opus 22, whose exercises and solfeggios expand systematically in length and pedagogical complexity. However, Burnham argues that Marx’s notion of organicism could be attributed to the “role of pedagogy in Marx’s conception of music theory:” “what Marx does is arrange the entire gamut of musical forms in a continuous progression from simple to complex.”<sup>75</sup> I generally agree with Burnham in that a morphological development of both analytical and practical thoughts, as applied by both Marx and Kinkel, might result from a systematic pedagogical approach rather than a complex attempt to employ different philosophical systems.

In terms of socio-political awareness, Kinkel includes a great deal of nationalist connotations in her writings. For example, she praises the influence of the fresh and inspiring temperament of the common people in her music-historical writing *Zur Geschichte der Musik* [“On Music History”].<sup>76</sup> In addition to this, her comparison of German and English societal phenomena uncovers a fairly nationalist point of view.<sup>77</sup> Although Linda Siegel argues that Kinkel’s review of Weber’s *Der Freischütz* in the *Neue Bonner Zeitung* did not acquire a political tone,<sup>78</sup> Kinkel’s fondness for Carl Maria von Weber might have been triggered by Weber’s reputation as a nationalist composer.<sup>79</sup> Furthermore, Kinkel must have come across Weber’s operas

---

<sup>74</sup> Scott Burnham, “The Role of Sonata Form in A. B. Marx’s Theory of Form,” 260.

<sup>75</sup> Ibid.

<sup>76</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Zur Geschichte der Musik*, 1.

<sup>77</sup> Ibid., 14.

<sup>78</sup> Linda Siegel, “Johanna Kinkel’s ‘Chopin als Komponist,’” 109.

<sup>79</sup> Carl Maria von Weber is considered the first composer to have established a German *Nationaloper*. Cf. Carl Dahlhaus, *Die Musik des 19. Jahrhunderts: Neues Handbuch der Musikwissenschaft*, Volume 6 (Laaber: Laaber Verlag, 1996), 52.

when she was staying in Berlin: Carl Friedrich Zelter (1758-1832), who was Fanny and Felix Mendelssohn's teacher, speaks very fondly of Carl Maria von Weber in his letters to Goethe.<sup>80</sup> When Kinkel was in Berlin, she became friendly with Fanny Mendelssohn and Emilie von Henning, who was a soprano singer at Zelter's *Singakademie*.<sup>81</sup> Zelter's fascination with Weber might have influenced his student's attitude towards Weber, leaving a strong and lasting impression on Johanna Kinkel. Kinkel liked Weber for his "imaginative melodies,"<sup>82</sup> which explains why the reviewer of Kinkel's Opus 20 cited earlier depicts that "the melodies of the short songs are mainly taken from famous operas and folk songs, whereupon Mozart and Weber are clearly outstanding."<sup>83</sup>

---

<sup>80</sup> In a letter to Goethe on 5 September 1821, Zelter praises Weber's music of *Der Freischütz* although he does not appreciate very much the opera's libretto: "A new opera, *Der Freischütz*, by Carl Maria von Weber, is causing a commotion. ... The music is greatly acclaimed and is really so good that the audience tolerates all the smoke and the steam [here Zelter refers to the huge amount of shooting scenes in the opera]. ... [T]hat the composer is no Spinozist you may gather from the fact that he has created such a prodigious work out of the nothing suggested above [here Zelter alludes to the simple libretto]." Letter cited in Lorraine Byrne Bodley, *Goethe and Zelter: Musical Dialogues* (Farnham and Burlington: Ashgate, 2009), 283-284. Four years later, in a letter from 24-26 December 1825, Zelter raves about "plenty of feasting and celebration" after the successful Berlin performance of Carl Maria von Weber's *Euryanthe*. In the same letter, Zelter also acknowledges von Weber's "intense industry, made twice as difficult by his feeble health." Letter cited in Lorraine Byrne Bodley, *Goethe and Zelter: Musical Dialogues* (Farnham and Burlington: Ashgate, 2009), 342.

<sup>81</sup> Cf. Paul Kaufmann, "Johanna Kinkel: Neue Beiträge zu ihrem Lebensbild," *Preussische Jahrbücher*, No. 22 (Berlin: Stilke, 1931), 10.

<sup>82</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Notizen zum Klavier- und Gesangsunterricht sowie zur Ästhetik der Musik*, no date, ULB S 2394, 16.

<sup>83</sup> "Gesangschulen," 141. Original citation: "Die Melodien dieser Liedchen sind größtentheils bekannten Opern und Volksliedern entlehnt, wobei Mozart und Weber hervorstechen."

Kinkel's literary output shows that she was a woman of her time in various ways, as she picked up typical Romantic analytical approaches, progressive and critical attitudes towards contemporary writings, as well as nationalist socio-political views, all of which she incorporated into her writings. Kinkel's novella, *Musikalische Orthodoxie*, summarizes her conception of pedagogues in her everyday life.<sup>84</sup> The novella uncovers the need for a great deal of patience and discipline from the teacher, in order to endure his or her job. The novella's main protagonist, Ida, agrees "to make sacrifices and teach beginners" in order to earn money, which would enable her to further develop her own artistic skills.<sup>85</sup> Furthermore, Kinkel includes in her novella the observation that "every great musical talent has to overcome a period of desperateness when becoming a teacher."<sup>86</sup> Another character, who is a professional musician, discusses the current job situation with one of his colleagues and states that "it is true that the piano teacher is a tortured person. [...] One is ashamed to endure such an abuse of the ears for the sake of what is referred to as 'living' by the philistine."<sup>87</sup>

---

<sup>84</sup> Although *Musikalische Orthodoxie* is clearly a fictional work, its parallels to Kinkel's biography, as well as to many aspects discussed in the previous sections of my paper, are evident: the low salary for piano teachers, the great deal of patience demanded from the teacher, the huge number of untalented students and the perception of music as a fashion rather than an art recur in the novella.

<sup>85</sup> Johanna Kinkel, "Musikalische Orthodoxie," in *Erzählungen*, ed. Gottfried & Johanna Kinkel (Stuttgart: Cotta, 1849), 304. Original citation: "indem sie das Opfer brachte, Anfänger zu unterrichten."

<sup>86</sup> Johanna Kinkel, "Musikalische Orthodoxie," 317. Original citation: "Jedes große musikalische Talent muß im Lehrerberuf anfangs eine Periode der Verzweiflung überwinden."

<sup>87</sup> Johanna Kinkel, "Musikalische Orthodoxie," 343. Original citation: "[A]ber es bleibt doch wahr, daß ein Clavierlehrer ein gequälter Mensch ist.... Man schämt sich vor sich selbst, daß man eine solche Ohrenmisshandlung um des Dings willen aushält, das Existenz genannt wird bei den 'Philistern'."



It seems that Kinkel observed a general tendency among musicians to consider their destiny as teachers an unbearable burden if they had to teach beginners in order to make a living. So what do these observations tell us about Johanna Kinkel's own teaching ethos? Kinkel describes the profession of a teacher as fairly unprofitable, even though she taught more than 200 piano students.<sup>88</sup> Nevertheless, one can interpret her negative connotations as a warning and an advisory to other teachers, rather than a confession out of pure desperation. Kinkel accepted a certain amount of modesty and sacrifice from music teachers as natural. Her prefaces and practical instructions indicate a realistic approach to teaching, prioritizing patience and slow progress. Kinkel must have been a patient teacher herself, and also expected a great deal of patience from her colleagues. This is especially reflected in her *Eight Letters to a Friend on Piano Teaching*, in which she says that "it does not take any special musical talent to teach small children the correct position of their fingers while playing; it only takes patience and assiduousness."<sup>89</sup>

### **Johanna Kinkel's pedagogical approach as an attractant to like-minded revolutionaries and a deterrent to conservative genteel families**

Kinkel's elaborate pedagogical approach covers not only technical, physical and emotional issues for teachers and students of voice and piano, but also musical analysis and music history. Particularly worthy of attention is Kinkel's approach to music history and aesthetics, in which she embeds both typical nineteenth-century

---

<sup>88</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Briefe aus London II*, 1855, ULB S 2390, no pagination.

<sup>89</sup> Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 4. Original citation: "Es ist gar keine besondere musikalische Begabung dazu nöthig, kleine Kinder bei ihren Stückchen zu beaufsichtigen, ob sie die Finger richtig setzen; nur Geduld und Gewissenhaftigkeit."

concepts (such as the consideration of an overall *Idee* and a naturalist anti-virtuosic attitude) as well as critical reflections of contemporary phenomena (as shown through Kinkel's approach to the periodization of music history). Despite (or perhaps because of) Kinkel's critical and progressive way of thinking, her methods did not seem to be very popular among other teachers, or practiced during her lifetime as, among her pedagogical works, only her Opus 20 received a review in the musical print media.<sup>90</sup> Furthermore, Kinkel had difficulties finding enough new students, especially at the time when Gottfried Kinkel's republican attitude caused him unemployment, for which her teaching was supposed to make up financially.

Linda Siegel states that a wider accessibility to Kinkel's works and progressive ideas was limited because only a few of Kinkel's pedagogical writings have been published.<sup>91</sup> Taking into account that Kinkel's *Lectures on Mendelssohn, Mozart, and Beethoven* as well as her *Lecture on Musical History*, her *Notes on Piano and Singing Teaching*, and her *Lecture on Harmony* have never been published in either German or English, Siegel has a valid point. However, Kinkel did publish her most comprehensive writing, *Eight Letters to a Friend on Piano Teaching*, in both German and English (which built upon her *Notes on Piano and Singing Teaching* mentioned above), as well as her two singing methods, Opus 20 and Op 22. She also gave a public lecture on music history in London. Nevertheless, these accomplishments did not make it into the pedagogical or historical canon of her time. Siegel concludes that Kinkel's "artistic reputation was not large enough to warrant an interest in her thoughts about music, as was that of, say, Clara Schumann."<sup>92</sup>

---

<sup>90</sup> Although most of the print media did Johanna Kinkel no favors, she had no difficulties finding publishers for her own works, partially due to both Johanna and Gottfried Kinkel's self-censorship. See Johanna & Gottfried Kinkel, *Liebe treue Johanna! Liebster Gott!* ed. Monica Klaus, second volume (Bonn: Stadtarchiv und Stadthistorische Bibliothek, 2008), 566-567.

<sup>91</sup> Linda Siegel, "Johanna Kinkel's 'Chopin als Komponist,'" 105.

<sup>92</sup> *Ibid.*

Considering Kinkel's strong political connotations in her pedagogical writings and the general public perception of an artistically talented woman as being strongly influenced by their male counterparts or parents,<sup>93</sup> it might have been Kinkel's reputation as a politically-oriented woman that prevented her from a more profitable career as a professional teacher, especially in Germany. Kinkel's "widely publicized involvement in politics,"<sup>94</sup> as well as the great deal of socio-cultural phenom-

---

<sup>93</sup> When Nancy Reich elaborates on the biographical backgrounds of some well-known nineteenth-century female song composers in her article "European Composers and Musicians, ca. 1800-1890," it becomes evident that all of them were received in relationship to their male partners or parents. Louise Reichardt (1779-1826) published some of her compositions in a joint collection with her father in 1800; Josephine Lang (1815-1880) began her musical career joining her parents at the Munich court as a singer; Fanny Hensel (1805-1847) published her first works in her famous brother Felix Mendelssohn's collections; Clara Schumann (1819-1896), who had enjoyed an excellent musical education by her father, composed almost all of her Lieder after her marriage to Robert Schumann, with whom she also published joint collections; Pauline Viardot's (1821-1910) musical career began under the guidance of her father Manuel Garcia, a well-known singer and composer, who is also praised as a vocal pedagogue by Johanna Kinkel. Cf. Johanna Kinkel, *Notizen zum Klavier- und Gesangsunterricht*, ULB S 2394, 5. For further details on the female composers introduced above see Nancy Reich, "European Composers and Musicians, ca. 1800-1890," in *Women and Music: A History*, ed. Karin Pendle, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2001), 152.

<sup>94</sup> Linda Siegel, "Johanna Kinkel's 'Chopin als Komponist,'" 105. For details on the Kinkels' representation in the public media, see for example "Noch einmal für Kinkel," in *Neue Leipziger Zeitung* 242 (1850): 961. Here, a pro-Kinkel article reveals that many daily newspaper articles publically despised Kinkel and his wife: "Several newspapers report on the humanity with which Kinkel is being treated in Spandau. These reports are not true. ... He [Kinkel] is exposed to his superior, who is 'loyal' to the greatest extent. His wife is not allowed to visit him 'as she is prejudicial to his peace of mind and his indoctrination.'" Original citation: "Verschiedene Zeitungen geben Berichte über die Humanität, mit der Kinkel in Spandau behandelt würde. Diese Berichte sind unwahr. ... Er [Kinkel] ist der Willkür eines Vorgesetzten preisgegeben, der 'Frommer' im höchsten Grade ist. Der Besuch seiner Frau wurde verweigert, 'weil sie seinem Seelenheil, seiner Bekehrung hinderlich sei'.

ena revealed in her writings and in her Opus 20, might have deterred contemporary teachers, students, and, more importantly, parents from associating with Kinkel and her controversial politics. Kinkel's inclusion of humorous comments on gender roles and on the relationship between the state and the church<sup>95</sup> in her *Eight Letters to a Friend on Piano Teaching*, as well as her critical approach to contemporary fashions, show that Kinkel combined her political and socio-cultural views with her profession as a teacher. This is one of the main reasons why Kinkel's pedagogical approach was received with suspicion during her lifetime and why it has now been nearly forgotten. Johanna Kinkel's writings bear witness to her extraordinary life, not only as a musician with "an unusually broad knowledge of music,"<sup>96</sup> but also as a middle-class female composer who challenged the conventions of her time.

---

<sup>95</sup> In her *Eight Letters*, Kinkel explains that "Salon and music relate to each other like state and church: both can only improve if they are being kept separately." Johanna Kinkel, *Acht Briefe*, 10. Original citation: "Gesellschaft und Musik stehen jetzt wie Staat und Kirche; mit beiden kann es nur besser werden, wenn sie scharf gesondert bleiben."

<sup>96</sup> Linda Siegel, "Johanna Kinkel's 'Chopin als Komponist,'" 106.

## Bibliography

- “Gesangschulen.” *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 27 (30 September 1849): 141-142.
- “Noch einmal für Kinkel.” *Neue Leipziger Zeitung* 242 (1850): 961.
- Abert, Anna Amalie & Thomas Baumann. “Hiller, Johann Adam.” In *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vol. 11, 512-516. London: Macmillan, 2001.
- Ackermann, Peter. “Palestrina.” In *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, ed. Ludwig Finscher. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vol. 13, Personenteil, 7-46. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2005.
- Baini, Giuseppe. *Memorie storico-critiche della vita e delle opere di G. P. da Palestrina*. 2 volumes. Rome: Societa Tipografica, 1828.
- Beattie Davis, Richard. “Henselt, Adolf.” In *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vol. 11, 383-386. London: Macmillan, 2001.
- Bent, Ian. *Music Analysis in the Nineteenth Century*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Bröcker, Marianne & Günther Massenkeil, eds. *Studien zur Bonner Musikgeschichte des 18. und 19. Jahrhunderts*. Cologne: Arno Volk-Verlag, 1978.
- Bröcker, Marianne. “Johanna Kinkels schriftstellerische und musikpädagogische Tätigkeit.” In *Studien zur Bonner Musikgeschichte des 18. und 19. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Marianne Bröcker & Günther Massenkeil, 37-48. Cologne: Arno Volk-Verlag, 1978.
- Burnham, Scott. “The Role of Sonata Form in A. B. Marx’s Theory of Form.” *Journal of Music Theory* 33 (1989): 247-271.
- Byrne Bodley, Lorraine. *Goethe and Zelter: Musical Dialogues*. Farnham and Burlington: Ashgate, 2009.
- Caplin, William E. “Theories of Musical Rhythm in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries.” In *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*, ed. Thomas Christensen, 657-694. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

- Christensen, Thomas, ed. *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Dahlhaus, Carl. *Die Musik des 19. Jahrhunderts. Neues Handbuch der Musikwissenschaft*. Volume 6. Laaber: Laaber Verlag, 1996.
- Davis, Deanna C. "The Veil of Fiction: Pedagogy and Rhetorical Strategies in Carl Czerny's *Letters on the Art of Playing the Pianoforte*." In *Beyond the Art of Finger Dexterity: Reassessing Carl Czerny*, ed. David Gramit, 67-81. New York: University of Rochester Press, 2008.
- Deaville, James. "A Star is Born? Czerny, Liszt, and the Pedagogy of Virtuosity." In *Beyond the Art of Finger Dexterity: Reassessing Carl Czerny*, ed. David Gramit, 52-66. New York: University of Rochester Press, 2008.
- Ervedosa, Clara G. "Johanna Kinkel." In *Vom Salon zur Barrikade: Frauen der Heinezeit*, ed. Irina Hundt, 323-335. Stuttgart and Weimar: Metzler, 2002.
- Finscher, Ludwig, ed. *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vols. 10 and 13. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2003 and 2005.
- Gramit, David, ed. *Beyond the Art of Finger Dexterity: Reassessing Carl Czerny*. New York: University of Rochester Press, 2008.
- Hiller, Johann Adam. *Anweisung zum musikalisch-richtigen Gesange, mit hinlänglichen Exempeln erläutert*. Leipzig: Johann Friedrich Junius, 1774.
- Hochradner, Thomas. "Probleme der Periodisierung von Musikgeschichte." *Acta Musicologica* 67 (1995): 55-70.
- Hundt, Irina. *Vom Salon zur Barrikade: Frauen der Heinezeit*. Stuttgart and Weimar: Metzler, 2002.
- Kaufmann, Paul. "Johanna Kinkel: Neue Beiträge zu ihrem Lebensbild." *Preussische Jahrbücher* 22 (1931): 1-47.
- Kier, Herfried. "Kiesewetter." In *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, ed. Ludwig Finscher. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vol. 10, Personenteil, 87-91. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2003.
- Kinkel, Johanna & Gottfried Kinkel, eds. *Erzählungen*. Stuttgart: Cotta, 1849.
- . *Liebe treue Johanna! Liebster Gottit!* Compiled by Monica Klaus, ed. Norbert Schloßmarcher. 3 vols. Bonn: Stadtarchiv und Stadthistorische Bibliothek, 2008.

- Kinkel, Johanna. "Erinnerungsblätter aus dem Jahre 1848." *Deutsche Monatsschrift für Politik, Wissenschaft, Kunst und Leben* 4 (1851): 39-108.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Musikalische Orthodoxie." In *Erzählungen*, ed. Gottfried & Johanna Kinkel, 303-370. Stuttgart: Cotta, 1849.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Acht Briefe an eine Freundin über Clavier-Unterricht*. Stuttgart: Cotta, 1852.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Briefe aus London I*. 1855 (?). ULB S 2390.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Friedrich Chopin als Komponist*. 1855. ULB S 2399.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Hans Ibeles in London*. 2 vols. Stuttgart: Cotta, 1860.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Lecture on Beethoven's earliest Sonatas, including Opus 10*. No date. ULB 2397.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Lecture on Mozart*. No date. ULB S 2396.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Musical History*. 1853 (?). ULB S 2393.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Musikalisches aus London*. No date. ULB S 2391.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Notizen zum Klavier- und Gesangsunterricht*. No date. ULB S 2394.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Opus 20: Anleitung zum Singen, für Kinder von drei bis sieben Jahren*. Mainz: Schott, 1849.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Opus 22: Tonleitern und Solfeggien für die Altstimme / Solfeggios for Contralto-Voice*. London: Schott, 1852.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Zur Geschichte der Musik*. 1853 (?). ULB S 2393.
- Klaus, Monica. *Johanna Kinkel: Romantik und Revolution*. Cologne: Böhlau, 2008.
- Lewald, Fanny. *Zwölf Bilder nach dem Leben*. Berlin: Otto Janke, 1888.
- Liszt, Franz. *Life of Chopin*. Transl. Martha Walker Cook. Boston and New York: Ditson, 1863.
- Lindeman, Stephan & George Barth. "Czerny, Carl." In *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vol. 6, 824-827. London: Macmillan, 2001.
- Mainzer, Abbé. *Singschule oder praktische Anweisung zum Gesange verbunden mit einer allgemeinen Musiklehre*. Trier: Mainzer, 1831.

- Müller, Helmut, et al. *Deutsche Geschichte in Schlaglichtern*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Mannheim, Vienna and Zurich: Meyers Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1990.
- Pendle, Karin. *Women and Music: A History*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2001.
- Plantinga, Leon. "The Piano and the Nineteenth Century." In *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. Larry Todd. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, 1-15. New York and London: Routledge, 2004.
- Reich, Nancy. "European Composers and Musicians, ca. 1800-1890." In *Women and Music: A History*, ed. Karin Pendle. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, 147-174. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2001.
- Roche, Jerome. *Palestrina*. London: Oxford University Press, 1971.
- Sadie, Stanley, ed. *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vols. 11 & 25. London: Macmillan, 2001.
- Siegel, Linda. "Johanna Kinkel's 'Chopin als Komponist' and Other Musical Writings: Untapped Source Readings in the History of Romantic Music Author(s)." *College Music Symposium* 43 (2003): 105-125.
- Todd, Larry, ed. *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. New York and London: Routledge, 2004.
- von Asten-Kinkel, Adelheid. "Johanna Kinkel in England." *Deutsche Revue* 21 (1901): 178-192.
- von Winterfeld, Carl. *Johannes Pierluigi von Palestrina: Seine Werke und deren Bedeutung für die Geschichte der Tonkunst: Mit Bezug auf Baini's neueste Forschungen*. Breslau: Adelholz, 1832.
- Wangermée, Robert. "Thalberg, Sigismond." In *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, vol. 25, 383-386. London: Macmillan, 2001.